**Functional biogeography of the thermal thresholds for post-dispersal embryo growth in *Conopodium majus***

Running title: Functional biogeography of embryo growth

Cristina Blandino1,2, Brith Natlandsmyr3, Sylvi M. Sandvik4, Hugh W. Pritchard2,5, Eduardo Fernández-Pascual6, \*

1 Department of Biological, Geological and Environmental Science, University of Catania, Catania, Italy

2 Royal Botanic Gardens, Kew, Wakehurst, Ardingly, Haywards Heath RH17 6TN, UK

3 Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, University of Bergen, Bergen, Norway

4 Department of Natural Sciences, University of Agder, Kristiansand, Norway

5 Kunming Institute of Botany, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Kunming, Yunnan 650201, PR China

6 Biodiversity Research Institute (IMIB), University of Oviedo - CSIC - Principality of Asturias, Mieres, Spain <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4743-9577>

\* Corresponding author: Eduardo Fernández-Pascual, Instituto Mixto de Investigación en Biodiversidad, Campus de Mieres, Edificio de Investigación, 5ª planta, c/ Gonzalo Gutiérrez Quirós s/n, E-33600 Mieres, Spain. Email: fernandezpeduardo@uniovi.es. Telephone: +34985104781.

**BIOSKETCHES**

Cristina Blandino is a postdoctoral researcher at the University of Catania, Italy. Her main line of research is the germination ecology of Mediterranean species. Eduardo Fernández-Pascual is an associate professor of Botany at the University of Oviedo working on the seed regeneration niche. Brith Natlandsmyr………, Sylvi M. Sandvik is an associate professor of Ecological Botany at the University of Agder working on plant pollination and reproduction in alpine habitats... ………., Hugh W. Pritchard………..

**ABSTRACT**

Plant regeneration by seeds is driven by a set of physiological traits, many of which have been shown to have functional intraspecific variation along biogeographic gradients. In many species, germination phenology depends on a germination delay imposed by post-dispersal embryo growth (a.k.a. morphological dormancy). Post-dispersal embryo growth occurs as a function of environmental temperatures and shows base, optimum and ceiling temperatures (i.e. cardinal temperatures or thermal thresholds). However, the biogeographical variation in such thresholds has never been tested at continental scales. Here we have used a thermal time approach and field experiments to assess variability in embryo growth thermal thresholds in the geophyte *Conopodium majus* (Apiaceae) across its distribution from the Iberian Peninsula to Scandinavia. Thermal thresholds varied across the latitudinal gradient, with optimum temperatures between 2.5 and 5.2 ºC, ceiling temperatures between 12 and 20.5 ºC and base temperatures between -6.6 and -2.7 ºC. Germination in the field peaked in the months of January and February. The limiting factor for embryo growth was the ceiling temperature, which was correlated with latitude and the bioclimatic environment of each population. In contrast, the optimal and base temperature were independent of local climate. These results support that the thermal thresholds for embryo growth are a functional ecophysiological trait driving seed germination phenology and seed responses to the environment.

**KEYWORDS**

Cardinal temperatures for germination, Apiaceae, *Conopodium majus,* Embryo:endosperm ratio, Morphological dormancy, Post-dispersal embryo growth, functional seed traits, plant regeneration, intraspecific variation

**INTRODUCTION**

The three aims of functional biogeography are to describe the distribution of functions along environmental gradients and across spatial scales; to use this information to explain the geographic distribution of organisms; and to predict their responses to environmental changes using trait-based predictive models (Violle et al., 2014). A relevant aspect of plant function that has been underutilized by biogeographical studies is the physiological thermal control of plant reproduction (Bykova et al., 2012), and especially seed germination. The temperature to which imbibed seeds are exposed affects their germination rate (Fernández-Pascual et al., 2019). This phenomenon can be described by the definition of the “cardinal temperatures”, i.e., the optimum temperature (To), at which the germination rate is maximal and the base (Tb) and ceiling (Tc) temperatures that are, respectively, the coldest and the highest temperature at which the progress towards germination occurs. The measurement of these temperatures for a given species enables prediction of its seed germination rate and germination success under different temperatures (Orrù et al., 2012). Therefore, the cardinal temperatures are key parameters to explain the contribution of regeneration thermal niches on species distributions and responses to climatic changes.

In many species however, a seed germination delay prevents seeds from germinating even in the presence of suitable conditions, with the objective of avoiding the exposure of seedlings to unfavourable environments and timing germination phenology to favourable regeneration windows (Lamont & Pausas, 2023; Pausas et al., 2022). A particular case of seed germination delay occurs when the embryo, at the time of dispersal, is not completely developed and needs to grow to a critical size before germination can occur; a trait known as post-dispersal embryo growth or morphological dormancy (Baskin & Baskin, 2004). As happens with germination, temperature is a major environmental driver of post dispersal embryo growth (Baskin et al., 2000; Blandino et al., 2019; Phartyal et al., 2009; Vandelook et al., 2007, 2009; Vandelook, 2008), influencing the rate of development of the embryo, a mechanism that allows a precise timing of germination (Porceddu et al., 2017).

Biogeographical variation in several germination traits is well documented. For example, seeds from warmer sites have been shown to have lower minimum temperatures for germination at different geographical scales (Daws et al., 2004; Rosbakh & Poschlod, 2015). The requirements for cold stratification can also vary according to the local climate, as it has been demonstrated that populations from habitats with longer winters require a longer period of cold stratification compared with populations from milder habitats (Allen & Meyer, 1998). However, to our knowledge, much less research has been dedicated to traits related to post-dispersal embryo growth. Mondoni et al. (2008) compared morphological dormancy between mountain and lowland populations of the temperate woodland forb *Anemone nemorosa* and found that, although embryo size at dispersal was similar in all the populations, embryo growth at cool temperatures was faster in the mountain population. This suggests a capacity of morphological dormancy to adapt to local conditions, either by local adaptation or phenotypic plasticity, analogous to that shown by physiological dormancy (Fernández-Pascual et al., 2013). Further research is warranted, to measure the thermal thresholds for post-dispersal embryo growth across wider biogeographical scales and investigate whether they vary in association with environmental gradients. To our knowledge, a study on temperature regulation of embryo growth across the whole latitudinal distribution of a species has not been performed yet.

In this study, we assess the functional biogeography of post-dispersal embryo growth in the geophyte *Conopodium majus* (Apiaceae) across its latitudinal distribution, from the Iberian Peninsula to Scandinavia. To do this, we develop a model of embryo growth as a function of temperature to describe its cardinal temperatures for embryo growth. Previously (Blandino et al., 2019), we have demonstrated that Scottish populations of the geophyte *Conopodium majus* require post-dispersal embryo growth, and that embryo growth and germination occur only at a narrow range of temperatures around 5 °C. Such narrow thermal control in a species with a relatively wide latitudinal distribution could make the species vulnerable to shifts in its regeneration niche in a scenario of changing climate (Walck et al., 2011), unless the species shows some functional variation in its embryo growth thermal thresholds. Therefore, we hypothesized that (1) the thermal thresholds for embryo growth will show variation across populations sampled on the species’ latitudinal gradient; and (2) the variation of thermal thresholds will be related to bioclimatic features along the latitudinal gradient. In particular, we predicted that thermal thresholds for embryo growth would be influenced by the high maximum temperatures and drought at the lower latitudes, and by the low minimum temperatures at the higher latitudes.

**MATERIALS AND METHODS**

***Study species***

*Conopodium majus* (Apiaceae) is a geophyte with a European Atlantic distribution from Southern Spain to Central Norway (Tutin et al., 1968). As is common in *Apiaceae*, seeds of *Conopodium majus* possess undeveloped linear embryos (Martin, 1946) and germinate when they reach a length close to the full length of the endosperm (Blandino et al., 2019). For this reason, in this study, the relative embryo size (i.e. embryo length / endosperm length, hereafter referred to as “E:E ratio”) is used to describe embryo development, and germination capability is defined as the point at which E:E ratio is ≥ 1. In *Conopodium majus*, germination has been observed to occur both at 0 and 5 °C with a similar rate of embryo growth (Blandino et al., 2019). Such low temperature requirements are indicative of germination in winter. For a species adapted to woodlands as well as oligotrophic grasslands, the control of the germination process in this way can allow seedlings to establish before the development of a tree canopy or of competing vegetation.

***Seed collection***

Mericarps of *Conopodium majus* were collected in the summer of 2016 from nine naturally occurring populations sampled across the western European latitudinal range of the species (Table 1). Since the seed cannot be separated from the fruit in this species, the dispersal unit will be referred hereafter to as the “seed”. A population was sampled only if it consisted of at least 200 individual plants. Seeds were sampled from 50 plants within the population to secure a representative sample of the genetic variability of the population. At least 4000 seeds were collected from each population. All seeds were collected between July and August 2016 and the experiments started within three weeks from seed collection. Seeds were kept at below full hydration under ambient condition on a laboratory bench until the beginning of the tests.

***Initial measurements***

Each collection was cleaned from debris and empty seeds were removed using a gravity seed separator machine. From each population, 10 seeds were selected randomly and allowed to rehydrate overnight at 20 ̊ºC and 100% RH. The seeds were then placed on 1% agar-water for 24 hours to become fully imbibed and reactivate their metabolism. Thereafter, seeds were prepared for vital staining with 1% aqueous solution of triphenyl tetrazolium chloride (TZ). A slice of seed coat was removed from the dorsal surface of each seed using a scalpel and seeds were incubated in TZ solution at 30 ̊ºC in the dark for 24 hours. Each seed was then cut longitudinally, and the embryo was extracted. Embryos and endosperms were photographed using a camera (Carl Zeiss Axiocam Colour) mounted on a Stemi SV 11 Microscope (Carl Zeiss, Welwin Garden City, Herts, UK) microscope and their lengths measured using the software Axiovision 3.1.2.1 (Carl Zeiss Vision GmbH). The initial relative embryo length was measured only for the seeds that stained red with the TZ, i.e., indicating viability; unstained seeds / embryos were discarded. Relative embryo size was used because it describes the growth of the embryo regardless the size of each seed.

From each population 99 seeds were placed in a controlled humidity room at 15% RH and left to dry. The dry seed weight of 99 seeds for each population was measured using a precision scale. The differences in seed dry mass and initial E:E across populations are reported in Table 2.

***Embryo growth in controlled temperature conditions***

From each population and treatment, 16 subsamples of 15 seeds each were randomly taken and sown in separate, 8 cm diameter Petri dishes containing 1% agar-water substrate. Seeds were sown at -2.5 ºC, 0 ºC, 2.5 ºC, 5 ºC, 7.5 ºC and 10 ºC in incubators with a daily light regime of 12 hours of light and 12 hours of darkness. Every 14 days one subsample from each population and treatment was retrieved and the 15 seeds were placed for 24 hours in 1% TZ solution at 30 ̊C in the dark, after a slice of the seed coat was removed. From this subsample, the embryo and endosperm length of 10 viable seeds was measured. In this species the radicle emerges when the embryo is fully grown and has reached the same length as the endosperm. Therefore, an E:E value of 1 was assigned to all germinated seeds. Seed measurement was stopped when the seeds ceased germinating. The experiment continued for 224 days, until all the 16 subsample assessments were concluded.

***Calculation of a thermal model for embryo growth***

The average E:E ratio of 10 seeds for each population x temperature x time combination was calculated. All the temperatures for the same population had the same initial E:E ratio value at time = 0, while the maximum value was fixed at 1, after which the seed was considered to be able to germinate. Since the data followed a sigmoidal growth distribution, except the treatments at -2.5 °C, a logistic model was fitted to each population x temperature combination using the software OriginLab 9.0. The models of each population were bounded between the initial value of E:E for that population and 1. A linear model was fitted to the -2.5°C treatments. From the equation of the logistic and linear models, it was possible to calculate the time expressed in days (tr) at which each temperature x population combination would have reached the following deciles of relative embryo size: 0.3, 0.4, 0.5, 0.6 and 0.7. Deciles < 0.3 could not be calculated because they were under initial E:E. Deciles > 0.7 were not calculated to keep the symmetry of the analyses regarding deciles of the population. For each treatment, the embryo growth rate was calculated as 1/tr.

For each population and decile, embryo growth rate was plotted against temperature. Each dataset was visually divided in a sub-optimal and supra-optimal range, using the point with the highest value of 1/tr as the dividing point. Liner regressions were fitted separately to the sub- and supra-optimal ranges. The intersection with the temperature axis of the sub-optimal and supra-optimal regression are, respectively, the base (Tb) and the ceiling (Tc) temperatures; these are the temperatures below and above which the embryo growth rate was equal to 0. The optimal temperature (To), defined as the temperature at which the rate of embryo growth is estimated to be fastest, is the x-coordinate of the intersection point between sub-optimal and supra-optimal regressions. Then, for each population, the cardinal temperatures (Tb, Tc and To) were averaged across all the deciles calculated to define an average value of the population (ELLIS et al., 1986). The regression lines of each decile were recalculated and forced to pass through a common origin defined by the average Tb (for the sub-optimal regressions) or the average Tc (for the supra-optimal regressions) (Hardegree, 2006). For the three southernmost populations, only the cardinal temperatures calculated for the relative embryo size of 0.4, 0.5 and 0.6 were used, because it was not possible to fit a supra-optimal regression to the 0.3 decile.

The slopes of these new linear regressions were then taken as a reciprocal to estimate the sub-optimal (θb) and supra-optimal (θc) thermal time for embryo growth. θ, expressed in degree days (°Cd), indicates the amount of thermal time units above Tb (θb) or below Tc (θc) that the seed has to accumulate for the embryo to reach successive E:E deciles. For each population, the deciles were plotted against θb and θc, expressed both as their value and as the natural logarithm of the value, and linear regressions were fitted to the data. The regressions fitted to θ and to log(θ) were compared in each case by their R2 (Hardegree, 2006). The regression models with the highest R2 were chosen to represent the rate of embryo growth as a function of thermal time for each population. The R2 of the models obtained fitting embryo growth and log-normal (log °Cd) were slightly higher than the R2 of the model obtained using normal distributed thermal times (°C). The only exception was constituted by the population CHO, for which the best model fit was obtained using the non-transformed thermal time values, thus describing a linear increase of relative embryo size with accumulated heat.

***Embryo growth in natural conditions***

Embryo growth in the soil was recorded for three population representing the southern (CHO), middle (WAK) and northern (BER) distribution of the species. The experiment was replicated in two locations where *Conopodium majus* naturally occurs: at Wakehurst Place, England (site of collection of the “WAK” population); and in a meadow on the periphery of Bergen, Norway (close to the site of collection of the “BER” population). Sixteen subsamples of 20 seeds for each population and experimental site were mixed with 20 g of soil collected at the site and passed through a 3 mm sieve. Seeds and soil were placed in mesh net bags and buried at a depth of 5 cm. A datalogger that recorded soil temperature every 30 minutes was placed in each location (Tinytag View 2, Gemini Dataloggers Ltd., Chichester. UK and EasyLog USB-2, Lascar Electronics, in Norway). The seeds were buried in England on 1st September 2016 and in Norway on 14th September 2016. Every 14 days a bag for each population was retrieved and the soil washed. Seed bags buried in Norway were shipped to England for measurements. All the seeds retrieved were prepared for TZ staining and their embryo and endosperm lengths measured. It was easiest to measure the seeds when most of the seeds were not germinated. With an increasing number of germinated seeds and seedlings, the amount of empty seed coats left in the soil bags made it difficult to distinguish between mouldy or germinated seeds. At this point, the experiment was terminated, representing nine measurements in Norway and thirteen in England.

***Validation of the thermal time model with field data***

In order to compare the embryo growth predicted by the thermal time model with embryo growth in natural conditions, embryo growth in the field sites was plotted against time. A logistic regression was fitted to these curves, and from the equations, the tr to reach every decile of relative embryo growth was calculated. The units of thermal time required by each population to reach every tr during the field experiment were calculated for both field locations using the data recorded by the loggers. In order to account for every temperature fluctuation during the day, the thermal time was expressed in “°C 30 min” and the heat accumulated by the seed was calculated for every 30 minutes data-logged. The difference (ΔT) between each temperature record and the population To (averaged between deciles) was summed. When the temperature was higher than the average Tc or lower than the average Tb the heat accumulated was considered = 0 and the difference (ΔT) between each temperature record and the To was summed.

The time necessary in the field to accumulate enough heat to reach the thermal time necessary for each tr was compared with the tr estimated from the embryo growth data. The time (in days) needed to sum enough heat to reach the θTb and θTc calculated in the model, for each tr decile (tr model) in each population was compared with the time needed by each population to reach the same decile of relative embryo growth in the field (tr field). These estimates were then graphically compared expressing the different tr in function of E:E.

***Relationship between embryo growth and germination***

Germination was scored for each independent sample before measuring the relative embryo size and expressed as percentage of germinated seeds vs time. For each population, the germination data for the treatments at 2.5 and 5°C were fitted with the Boltzmann equation using the software OriginLab9. The other temperatures were not used because germination was too slow. For each population, from the fitted Boltzmann equation the day to reach 50% germination (tg50) was calculated. The tg50 was then used to calculate the corresponding E:E ratio at the same day using the logistic regression of the E:E data for the same treatment. For each population, the average E:E ratio corresponding to the tg50 for germination at the two temperatures used was displayed as the average E:E ratio for 50% germination in that population. The average between all the populations represented the average for the species.

***Relationship between environmental data and germination traits***

The relationship between embryo development and seed germination traits and geographical and bioclimatic data was explored for each population. A data matrix was built including latitude, altitude, average annual temperature, precipitation of the driest month, average maximum temperature of the hottest month and minimum average temperature of the coldest month, seed dry mass, initial E:E ratio and cardinal temperaturesfor each population. Climatic data for the seed collection sites was extracted from WorldClim (Fick & Hijmans, 2017). Data was checked for autocorrelation using the Pearson correlation coefficient in order to exclude the variables with a strong autocorrelation. Finally, a PCA was run on the dataset, scaling the axis.

**RESULTS**

***Initial embryo length and seed mass***

The initial relative embryo size ranged from an average value of 0.10 (±0.03 SD) for the population BER to an average value of 0.19 (±0.03 SD) for the population CHO (Table 2). Average seed dry mass ranged just under two-fold from 1.21 mg (±0.38 SD) in TRE to 2.03 mg (±0.53 SD) in FLE (Table 2).

***Embryo growth in controlled temperature conditions***

The rate of embryo growth was strictly dependent on the temperature and the increase in embryo size can be appreciated already after 14 days of imbibition. For all the populations, the temperature treatments with the highest rate of embryo growth were 2.5 and 5 °C. Clearly 0 °C is sub-optimal for embryo growth rate, and 7.5 and 10 °C were supra-optimal (Fig.1). The seeds survived cooling to -2.5 ºC but the embryo did not grow at this temperature.

***Relationship between embryo growth and germination***

The first germination was scored after 84 days of imbibition in the four Spanish populations at the temperatures of 0, 2.5 and 5 °C. The populations from WAK and BER first germinated after 112 days of imbibition. The last population to begin germinating was SCO, after 126 days of imbibition. Germination occurred when the embryo reached the same length of the endosperm (E:E=1) and an average E:E = 1 corresponded to 100% germination in the sample. The treatments that, after 32 weeks of imbibition had the highest average germination across all the populations were 2.5 °C, and 5 °C with, respectively, 97.7 and 98.4 % of seeds germinated in the last sampling. The lowest germination was observed at -2.5 and 10 °C. The population that reached, across all the treatments, the highest average germination at week 32 (the end of the experiment), was TRE (80% ± 32 SD) while the lowest was achieved by SCO (59%, ± 42 SD). The time to reach 50 % germination (T50g), interpolated with the Boltzmann equation ranged between 111 (BAS) and 147 days (FLE ) at 2.5 °C and between 116 (LEO) and 150 days (SCO) at 5 °C. The values of E:E corresponding to the estimated T50 in these two treatments were averaged between population and temperatures to describe a value of 0.89 ( ± 0.02 SD) for the species.

***Cardinal temperatures for embryo growth***

Between populations, Tb varied between -2.63 (SCO) and -6.65 °C (BER). In addition, To ranged from 2.54 (LEO) and 5.23 °C (CHO). Finally, Tc was between 12.08 (BER) and 20.54 °C (TRE) (Table 2).

***Embryo growth in natural conditions***

The minimum temperature recorded in Norway in winter was -2 °C in mid-November while the highest was recorded at the beginning of the experiment, on 15th September 2016 (18.5 °C). In England the minimum temperature recorded was 1.6 °C at the end of January and the maximum 17.0 °C, recorded on the same day as the Norwegian site, during an autumn heat wave. Embryo growth in natural condition was faster, for all the population tested, in the northern most location of Bergen where daily average temperatures were lower than at Wakehurst, UK. However, in both sites the rate of embryo growth started to increase when the temperatures fell below 10 °C (Fig. 2). Even if the southern population (CHO) had the greater initial E:E ratio, its growth rate was not different from the other populations tested. Eventually, the three growth curves tended to converge when an average E:E ratio approached 0.8 (Fig. 2). Germination in nature tended to peak in the months of January and February. Fitting a logistic regression to the curves permitted an estimation of the time, in days, to reach different deciles of relative embryo size.

***Comparison of the model with field data***

The comparison of the thermal models against estimates of embryo growth in the field gave different results between the three populations, but was consistent between experimental sites (Fig.3). Estimates of time to reach successive deciles of E:E ratio was similar if calculated using the ƟTb and ƟTc of the WAK population for both sites but higher than the Trg estimated from the logistic regression of embryo growth in the field. The BER population shown a rate of embryo growth that could be better predicted by the ƟTc rather than by ƟTb while both models diverged from the observed pattern of embryo growth in the southern population CHO.

***Environmental correlated of embryo growth traits***

A PCA (Fig. 4) ordered the populations according to their seed and germination traits and to the climate of the collection site. The first axis, that explained 50% of the variability in the data, separated the southern populations from the northern ones. The axis was described mostly by geographic and bioclimatic variables and the only seed traits that had a significant correlation with it were seed dry mass and the ceiling temperature for embryo growth (Tc). In particular, there was a strong negative correlation between precipitation of the driest month and Tc. Mountain populations of *Conopodium majus* were located in the southern portion of the distribution range of the species and were characterized by higher maximum temperatures and more severe drought stress. The seeds from these populations had a lower dry mass but a greater initial relative embryo size than the northern, lowland populations. The second axis explained 18.8 % of the variability in the data and had a significant correlation only with Tb and To. The two cardinal temperatures showed opposite trends, such that a higher optimum corresponded to a lower Tb. The two southern most populations, CHO and TRE, remained separated from the others: they came from the highest altitude and experience the strongest heat and drought stress. The remaining populations can be separated in three groups: SCO, BAS and LEO had the highest Tb, HER and FLE the biggest seeds and BER and WAK had the higher To.

**DISCUSSION**

*Conopodium majus* shows considerable intraspecific variability in the thermal thresholds for post-dispersal embryo growth along its European distribution. Additionally, variability in post-dispersal embryo growth thresholds appears related to the climate of the collection sites, with warmer and drier sites correlating with a capacity for embryos to grow at warmer temperatures. These results support that there is functional variation in the embryo growth temperatures, and therefore that they are functional ecophysiological traits.

The ceiling temperature for embryo growth varies between 12.1 and 20.5 °C and has a strong negative correlation with latitude and precipitation. Species from northern populations, that are less likely to experience long exposure to high autumnal temperatures, have lower values while the two southernmost populations, CHO and TRE, stand out for high Tc above 20 °C. Water stress is the main limiting factor for embryo development in these populations, that experience also a shorter winter and a Mediterranean continental climate. The higher Tc can therefore be an adaptation to cope with higher daily fluctuations in temperatures that can prevent the embryo from growing during warmer and potentially drier days during late autumn or early spring. Moreover, embryo growth (and the potential to germinate) under cold temperatures (close to 0°C) will enable the start of growth during winter and emergence under the snow to avoid drought, as has been suggested to be the case for other species able to grow in sub-alpine Mediterranean and submediterranean mountains (Fernández-Pascual et al., 2017).

The optimum temperature for embryo growth ranged between 2.5 and 5.2 °C (Table 2) and had a negative correlation with Tb, a phenomenon already observed for germination temperatures by Dürr et al. (2015). The second axis of our PCA ordination analysis can therefore be interpreted as reflecting the width of the suboptimal temperature range for embryo growth, i.e. the gap between Tb and To. The populations with the higher Tb (BAS, LEO and SCO) also have the lower To and therefore a narrower window of suboptimal conditions for embryo growth. Therefore, these populations are at greater risk of exposure to a reduced germination niche in the face of climate warming (Walck et al., 2011). These are also some of the populations at the milder and central points of our latitudinal gradient, i.e. northern Spain and the British Isles.

All the populations considered are estimated to have a negative base temperature for embryo growth, ranging from -6.7 °C in BER to -2.7 in BAS. Although it cannot be discarded that such low values are an artefact of the thermal time modelling approach, values of Tb lower than zero have been reported for some temperate trees, crops (mainly legumes) and wild plants but are not common (Dürr et al., 2015). However, to our knowledge, no values as low as -6.7 °C have been reported previously, the lowest being a Tb of -3.9 °C for *Cryptantha minima* (Boraginaceae) (Wei et al., 2009) and -4.5 °C for *Krascheninnikovia lanata* (Amaranthaceae) (Wang et al., 2006). The germination of *Cryptantha minima* at negative temperatures was explained as an adaptation to take advantage of the water of the snowmelt in early spring and develop its annual cycle before the summer drought (Wang et al., 2006). In the case of *Conopodium majus*, that is a perennial, this strategy could however offer some advantage at the southern range of its distribution, where summer drought can be a recurrent issue, as it has already been observed for Mediterranean subalpine species (Fernández-Pascual et al., 2017). *Krascheninnikovia lanata* seeds show a positive effect of seed size on the ability to germinate at sub-zero temperatures (Wang et al., 2006). The authors demonstrate that bigger seeds had a higher concentration of sugars (glucose, raffinose and sucrose) that probably lower the freezing point of the seed tissues. There are no reports on sub-zero germination in Apiaceae but an optimal temperature for embryo growth of 2 °C has already been described for *Heracleum spondylium* (STOKES, 1953) and is not unlikely that this species, or others from the same family, could present equally low Tb for embryo growth. However, it is unlikely that such low temperatures have a functional ecological role in embryo growth in the field: our field collected data and averaged climatic data from 2070-2000 for the collection sites of the populations studied show that such low average temperatures are rare in the natural environment of *Conopodium majus.* Therefore, in the field it is likely that embryo growth is possible throughout the winter season and is limited only by the higher temperatures in autumn. In fact, results from the ordination analysis, showed that the Tb is independent from climatic and geographic factors and is not even correlated to seed size or initial E:E ratio. Therefore, we can conclude that the limiting factor for embryo growth in *Conopodium majus* is the ceiling temperature and its interaction with warmer temperatures during the annual cycle.

**CONCLUSION**

*Conopodium majus* can be considered a model species for studying morphological dormancy due to its fine regulation of embryo growth by temperature and the coincidence between the temperature requirements for embryo growth and germination. To date only one study is known to have developed thermal models of embryo growth in a species of the Ranunculaceae family, *Aquilegia barbaricina* (Porceddu et al., 2017) and this work represents the first attempt to develop such a model on a species from Apiaceae.The thermal models developed in this study can be used to predict shifts in its temperature germination niche caused by different climate change scenarios, and in fact the dependence on a relatively low ceiling temperature means that warmer winter temperatures as a result of climate change could compromise post dispersal embryo growth and thus negatively impact the regeneration of *Conopodium majus*. However, *Conopodium majus* also shows potential for adaptation to the climatic environment along its latitudinal distribution, as expressed by the breadth of the temperature germination niche indicated by the cardinal temperatures of each population. In fact, post-dispersal embryo growth in *Conopodium majus* shows an intraspecific variability which is consistent with an ecological function in determining the timing of seedling emergence and establishment. This highlights the potential of embryo growth temperatures as a functional ecophysiological trait driving seed germination phenology and seed responses to the environment.

**AKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

Álvaro Bueno Sánchez, Joseba Garmendia, Luis Carlón, Giles Laverack and Maria Marin helped with seed collection.

**FUNDING**

This research received funding from the People Programme (Marie Curie Actions) of the European Union's Seventh Framework Programme FP7/2007-2013/ under REA grant agreement n°607785.

**CONFLICT OF INTEREST STATEMENT**

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

**AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS**

**Cristina Blandino**: Conceptualization; Methodology; Investigation; Data Curation; Formal Analysis; Visualization; Writing – Original Draft Preparation; Writing – Review & Editing. **Brith Natlandsmyr**: Investigation; Writing – Review & Editing. **Sylvi M. Sandvik**: Investigation; Writing – Review & Editing. **Hugh W. Pritchard**: Funding acquisition; Conceptualization; Methodology; Writing – Review & Editing. **Eduardo Fernández-Pascual**: Conceptualization; Methodology; Investigation; Writing – Review & Editing.

**TABLES**

**Table 1:** Provenance of seeds used in the experiments.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Population | Country | Location | Latitude | Longitude | Elevation (m a.s.l.) |
| HER | Norway | Herdla | 60º 34'29.784'' N | 4º 56' 53.627'' E | 37 |
| BER | Norway | Bergen | 60º 20' 7.35 N | 5º 22' 17.79'' E | 97 |
| FLE | Norway | Flekkeroya | 58º 4'5.34'' N | 7º 59' 53.56'' E | 19 |
| SCO | UK | Dalreoch Farm | 56º 44' 47.36'' N | 3º 32' 25.03'' W | 252 |
| WAK | UK | Wakehurst Place | 51º 04' 12.79'' N | 0º 05' 28.28'' W | 114 |
| BAS | Spain | Ondarre | 43º 01' 42.8'' N | 2º 03' 55.7'' W | 809 |
| LEO | Spain | El Tendero | 42º 54' 26,62'' N | 5º 49' 25,87'' W | 1426 |
| CHO | Spain | Central del Chorro | 40º 18' 26.17'' N | 5º 40' 09.39'' W | 1398 |
| TRE | Spain | Tremedal | 40º 22' 00.5'' N | 5º 37' 57.20'' W | 1555 |

**Table 2:**Average initial E:E (±SD), average seed dry mass ((±SD ) and cardinal temperatures averaged between deciles (± SD) in seeds of all populations of *Conopodium majus* studied.. In order to have a symmetric result around the middle value, if the lower deciles were excluded because too close to the initial embryo size, the higher ones were excluded too.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Population | Initial E:E (±SD) | Seed dry weight (mg) (±SD) | Tb (°C) | To (°C) | Tc (°C) | Deciles used |
| HER | 0.12 (±0.03) | 1.94 (±0.58) | -4.01 ± 0.57 | 4.26 ± 0.80 | 12.90 ± 1.86 | 0.3 - 0.7 |
| BER | 0.10 (±0.03) | 1.80 (±0.55) | -6.65 ± 0.62 | 4.58 ± 0.02 | 12.08 ± 1.32 | 0.3 - 0.7 |
| FLE | 0.17 (±0.04) | 2.03 (±0.53) | -3.90 ± 0.14 | 4.50 ± 0.07 | 13.70 ± 0.71 | 0.3 - 0.7 |
| SCO | 0.13 (±0.02) | 1.63 (±0.54) | -2.63 ± 0.38 | 2.80 ± 0.25 | 14.42 ± 2.47 | 0.3 - 0.7 |
| WAK | 0.10 (±0.02) | 1.75 (±0.42) | -6.20 ± 0.89 | 4.59 ± 0.11 | 14.44 ± 1.72 | 0.3 - 0.7 |
| BAS | 0.15 (±0.02) | 1.43 (±0.59) | -2.75 ± 0.10 | 2.69 ± 0.10 | 13.07 ± 0.93 | 0.3 - 0.7 |
| LEO | 0.12 (±0.03) | 1.66 (±0.52) | -3.17 ± 0.06 | 2.54 ± 0.03 | 14.64 ± 2.23 | 0.4 - 0.6 |
| CHO | 0.19 (±0.03) | 1.24 (±0.38) | -4.09 ± 0.59 | 5.23 ± 1.05 | 20.48 ± 9.09 | 0.4 - 0.6 |
| TRE | 0.11 (±0.02) | 1.21 (±0.38) | -6.47 ± 0.41 | 4.86 ± 0.04 | 20.54 ± 7.25 | 0.4 - 0.6 |

**FIGURES**

Patrón de fondo

Descripción generada automáticamente con confianza media

**Fig. 1:** Patterns of embryo growth (E:E ratio) for all the populations seeds of *Conopodium majus* and all temperatures tested. Each data point represents the average of ten replicate (± SE).

Gráfico, Gráfico de líneas

Descripción generada automáticamente

**Fig. 2:** Embryo growth in the field for buried seeds of *Conopodium majus*. Each data point represents the average E:E ratio of 20 seeds; soil temperature is also shown. The experiment started on 1st September 2016 in England and on 15th September 2016 in Norway. For each site, the experiment finished when all population reached 100% radicle emergence (corresponding to E:E =1).

*Gráfico

Descripción generada automáticamente*

**Fig. 3:**Time (in days) required by each population of *Conopodium majus* seeds in each field location to reach different deciles of E:E ratio according to: 1) interpolation from the logistic regression of embryo growth in the field (gray line); 2) ƟTb (blue line); and 3) ƟTc (red line) obtained from the model.

**Gráfico

Descripción generada automáticamente con confianza baja**

**Fig. 4:** Principal component analysis of seed traits (in red) and geographic and bioclimatic variables (in blue) across the latitudinal distribution of *Conopodium majus*.

**BIBLIOGRAPHY**

Allen, P. S., & Meyer, S. E. (1998). Ecological aspects of seed dormancy loss. *Seed Science Research, 8*(2), 183-191.

Baskin, C. C., Milberg, P., Andersson, L., & Baskin, J. M. (2000). Deep complex morphophysiological dormancy in seeds of \textit{Anthriscus sylvestris} (Apiaceae). *Flora, 195*(3), 245-251. <https://doi.org/10.1016/S0367-2530(17)30977-5>

Baskin, J. M., & Baskin, C. C. (2004). A classification system for seed dormancy. *Seed Science Research, 14*, 1-16.

Blandino, C., Fernández-Pascual, E., Marin, M., Vernet, A., & Pritchard, H. W. (2019). Seed ecology of the geophyte *Conopodium majus* (Apiaceae), indicator species of ancient woodland understories and oligotrophic meadows. *Plant Biology, 21*(3), 487-497. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1111/plb.12872>

Bykova, O., Chuine, I., Morin, X., & Higgins, S. I. (2012). Temperature dependence of the reproduction niche and its relevance for plant species distributions. *Journal of Biogeography, 39*(12), 2191-2200.

Daws, M. I., Lydall, E., Chmielarz, P., Leprince, O., Matthews, S., Thanos, C. A., Pritchard, H. W., Matthews, S., Thanos, C. A., & Pritchard, H. W. (2004). Developmental heat sum influences recalcitrant seed traits in Aesculus hippocastanum across Europe. *New Phytologist, 162*(1), 157-166. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8137.2004.01012.x>

Dürr, C., Dickie, J. B., Yang, X. Y., & Pritchard, H. W. (2015). Ranges of critical temperature and water potential values for the germination of species worldwide: contribution to a seed trait database. *Agricultural and Forest Meteorology, 200*, 222-232. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agrformet.2014.09.024>

ELLIS, R. H., COVELL, S., ROBERTS, E. H., & SUMMERFIELD, R. J. (1986). The Influence of Temperature on Seed Germination Rate in Grain Legumes: II. INTRASPECIFIC VARIATION IN CHICKPEA (Cicer arietinum L.) AT CONSTANT TEMPERATURES. *Journal of Experimental Botany, 37*(10), 1503-1515. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jxb/37.10.1503>

Fernández-Pascual, E., Jiménez-Alfaro, B., & Bueno, A. (2017, Jan). Comparative seed germination traits in alpine and subalpine grasslands: higher elevations are associated with warmer germination temperatures [Article]. *Plant Biology, 19*(1), 32-40. <https://doi.org/10.1111/plb.12472>

Fernández-Pascual, E., Jiménez-Alfaro, B., Caujapé-Castells, J., Jaén-Molina, R., & Díaz, T. E. (2013, Sep). A local dormancy cline is related to the seed maturation environment, population genetic composition and climate [Article]. *Annals of Botany, 112*(5), 937-945. <https://doi.org/10.1093/aob/mct154>

Fernández-Pascual, E., Mattana, E., & Pritchard, H. W. (2019, Apr). Seeds of future past: climate change and the thermal memory of plant reproductive traits [Review]. *Biological Reviews, 94*(2), 439-456. <https://doi.org/10.1111/brv.12461>

Fick, S. E., & Hijmans, R. J. (2017). WorldClim 2: new 1-km spatial resolution climate surfaces for global land areas. *International Journal of Climatology, 37*(12), 4302-4315. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1002/joc.5086>

Hardegree, S. P. (2006). Predicting germination response to temperature. I. Cardinal-temperature models and subpopulation-specific regression. *Annals of Botany, 97*(6), 1115-1125. <https://doi.org/10.1093/aob/mcl071>

Lamont, B. B., & Pausas, J. G. (2023). Seed dormancy revisited: Dormancy-release pathways and environmental interactions. *Functional Ecology, 37*(4), 1106-1125. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1111/1365-2435.14269>

Martin, A. C. (1946). The comparative internal morphology of seeds. *The American Midland Naturalist, 36*, 513-660.

Mondoni, A., Probert, R., Rossi, G., Hay, F., & Bonomi, C. (2008, Dec). Habitat-correlated seed germination behaviour in populations of wood anemone (Anemone nemorosa L.) from northern Italy. *Seed Science Research, 18*(4), 213-222. <https://doi.org/10.1017/s0960258508084997>

Orrù, M., Mattana, E., Pritchard, H. W., & Bacchetta, G. (2012). Thermal thresholds as predictors of seed dormancy release and germination timing: altitude-related risks from climate warming for the wild grapevine Vitis vinifera subsp sylvestris. *Annals of Botany, 110*(8), 1651-1660. <https://doi.org/10.1093/aob/mcs218>

Pausas, J. G., Lamont, B. B., Keeley, J. E., & Bond, W. J. (2022). Bet-hedging and best-bet strategies shape seed dormancy. *New Phytologist, 236*(4), 1232-1236. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1111/nph.18436>

Phartyal, S. S., Kondo, T., Baskin, J. M., & Baskin, C. C. (2009, Jun). Temperature requirements differ for the two stages of seed dormancy break in Aegopodium podagraria (Apiaceae), a species with deep complex morphophysiological dormancy. *Am J Bot, 96*(6), 1086-1095. <https://doi.org/10.3732/ajb.0800379>

Porceddu, M., Mattana, E., Pritchard, H. W., & Bacchetta, G. (2017). Dissecting seed dormancy and germination in Aquilegia barbaricina, through thermal kinetics of embryo growth. *Plant Biology, 19*(6), 983-993. <https://doi.org/10.1111/plb.12610>

Rosbakh, S., & Poschlod, P. (2015). Initial temperature of seed germination as related to species occurrence along a temperature gradient. *Functional Ecology, 29*(1), 5-14. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1365-2435.12304>

STOKES, P. (1953). A Physiological Study of Embryo Development in Heracleum sphondylium L.: III. The Effect of Temperature on Metabolism1. *Annals of Botany, 17*(1), 157-174. <https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordjournals.aob.a083338>

Tutin, T. G., Heywood, V. H., Burges, N. A., Moore, D. M., Valentine, D. H., Walters, S. M., & Webb, D. A. (1968). *Flora Europaea. Volume 2. Rosaceae to Umbelliferae.* Cambridge University Press.

Vandelook, F., Bolle, N., & Van Assche, J. A. (2007). Seed Dormancy and Germination of the European Chaerophyllum temulum (Apiaceae), a Member of a Trans-Atlantic Genus. *Annals of Botany, 100*(2), 233-239. <https://doi.org/10.1093/aob/mcm090>

Vandelook, F., Bolle, N., & Van Assche, J. A. (2009, Jun). Morphological and physiological dormancy in seeds of Aegopodium podagraria (Apiaceae) broken successively during cold stratification. *Seed Science Research, 19*(2), 115-123. <https://doi.org/10.1017/s0960258509301075>

Vandelook, F. V. A., J. A. (2008, Dec). Deep complex morphophysiological dormancy in Sanicula europaea (Apiaceae) fits a recurring pattern of dormancy types in genera with an Arcto-Tertiary distribution. *Botany, 86*(12), 1370-1377. <https://doi.org/10.1139/b08-103>

Violle, C., Reich, P. B., Pacala, S. W., Enquist, B. J., & Kattge, J. (2014). The emergence and promise of functional biogeography. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 111*(38), 13690-13696. <https://doi.org/doi:10.1073/pnas.1415442111>

Walck, J. L., Hidayati, S. N., Dixon, K. W., Thompson, K., & Poschlod, P. (2011). Climate change and plant regeneration from seed. *Global Change Biology, 17*(6), 2145-2161. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2010.02368.x>

Wang, R., Bai, Y., Low, N. H., & Tanino, K. (2006). Seed size variation in cold and freezing tolerance during seed germination of winterfat (Krascheninnikovia lanata) (Chenopodiaceae). *Canadian Journal of Botany, 84*(1), 49-59. <https://doi.org/10.1139/b05-143>

Wei, Y., Bai, Y., & Henderson, D. C. (2009). Critical conditions for successful regeneration of an endangered annual plant, Cryptantha minima: A modeling approach. *Journal of Arid Environments, 73*(9), 872-875. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaridenv.2009.03.008>